

**PROFESSIONAL JUDGMENT RATING FORM:  
NOVICE / INTERNSHIP LEVEL  
CRITICAL THINKING ABILITIES AND HABITS OF MIND**

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Position Title: \_\_\_\_\_

**YES NO**

**I would describe this individual as:**

- |     |     |   |
|-----|-----|---|
| ___ | ___ | 1. Willing to engage challenging problems in the workplace.                       |
| ___ | ___ | 2. Systematic in approaching problems and available solutions.                    |
| ___ | ___ | 3. Indifferent to problems constraining performance of co-workers.                |
| ___ | ___ | 4. Too quick to define problem situations in ways that neglect relevant context.  |
| ___ | ___ | 5. Too quick to discard potential alternative solutions for a problem.            |
| ___ | ___ | 6. Inclined to respond to problems with familiar but inappropriate strategies.    |
| ___ | ___ | 7. Intolerant of potential solutions outside of existing protocols or procedures. |
| ___ | ___ | 8. Willing to reconsider decisions in light of new information.                   |
| ___ | ___ | 9. Mindful of relevant considerations when addressing a dilemma.                  |
| ___ | ___ | 10. Likely to be the person to identify a problem that requires attention.        |

**This individual is one who:**

- |     |     |   |
|-----|-----|---|
| ___ | ___ | 1. Seeks clarification of the problem and the terminology used to discuss it.                 |
| ___ | ___ | 2. Seeks reasons and evidence to support offered assertions and evaluations.                  |
| ___ | ___ | 3. Belittles the views, opinions, suggestions, or perspectives of others.                     |
| ___ | ___ | 4. Applies policy or performs tasks without reflecting on quality or impact.                  |
| ___ | ___ | 5. Focuses more on the concerns of self or co-workers than on the needs of clients.           |
| ___ | ___ | 6. Worries more about the origin of an idea than its quality.                                 |
| ___ | ___ | 7. Generally declines to participate actively in problem solving strategy discussions.        |
| ___ | ___ | 8. Integrates new information and adjusts direction to resolve a difficult problem.           |
| ___ | ___ | 9. Anticipates consequences likely to occur as a result of decisions.                         |
| ___ | ___ | 10. Anticipates potential difficulties and suggests possible responses before problems arise. |

Evaluator: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_



© 1998, N. C. Facione and P. A. Facione. Permission is hereby granted to make and distribute copies for educational and non-commercial uses.

Insight Assessment, 1735 N. First Street, Ste 306, San Jose, CA 95112

Phone: 650-697-5628

[www.insightassessment.com](http://www.insightassessment.com)

**Professional Judgment:** To be effective, professionals must be willing and able to make sound judgments. That is, they must have the skills and the habits of mind which lead to decisions which give due consideration to the relevant methods, evidence, contexts, theories, and standards. The critical thinking skills of analysis, inference, and evaluation are central to this process, as is the ability to reflect on one's own problem solving and make needed corrections. Equally important is the consistent internal motivation to use one's thinking skills correctly. That motivation is manifest by being inquisitive, systematic, analytical, confident, judicious, open-minded, and intellectually honest as one makes judgments that are as precise and well-informed as the circumstances of one's professional practice will permit.

### Scoring and Interpretation of the Rating Form

If you do not know this individual well enough to answer **at least 17** of the twenty items with reasonable confidence, you should not complete this rating form. Critical thinking abilities and habits of mind are manifest with a possible top score of 20. To score the rating form:

**Score +1 point for each YES on items 1, 2, 8, 9, and 10.**  
**+1 point for each NO on items 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7.**

**Scores 17 - 20:** **Very Strong:** Repeatedly demonstrates the consistent internal motivation and mental ability to make professional judgments in the workplace. Makes judgments that are mindful of relevant considerations, contexts, methods and criteria. Has a style which reflects a judicious, open-minded and honest approach to judgments in the workplace.

**Scores 13 - 16:** **Positive:** Adequately demonstrates the ability and habits of mind to make professional judgments in the workplace. Generally fulfills the demands for professional judgment of the quality required of individuals holding this position.

**Scores 8-12:** **Marginal / Ambiguous:** Inconsistently demonstrates the ability and motivation for making professional judgments in the workplace. At times appears to lack the motivation or to lack the ability to make judgments of the quality required by individuals holding this position.

**Scores 4 - 7:** **Negative:** Demonstrates the lack of mental ability or personal motivation for making professional judgments in the workplace. Appears indifferent, resistant, closed minded, disorganized or biased. Most often appears to be unable or unwilling to make judgments of the quality required by individuals holding this position.

**Scores 0 - 3:** **Very Poor:** Constant demonstration of lack of thinking skills and a motivation not to make professional judgments in the workplace; has an aversion to honest engagement of reasons and evidence; makes thoughtless, unreflective, self-serving, or uninformed judgments. Has a style which reflects imprudence, intolerance, disorganization, and immaturity of judgment.